Why so angry (in Canada’s Prairies)?

By Warren Lovely

To judge from recent surveys/polling, the mood has turned a little dark in Canada, nowhere more so than in the prairie provinces. Why is the average Albertan, Saskatchewanian or Manitoban so testy? There are more than a few irritants one could point to, some longer standing, some of the more new. No question, runaway inflation is an increasingly pressing concern, even if that’s hardly unique to this region.

We’re not making light of affordability pressures. How could you with inflation where it is? Nor would we trivialize the apparent dissatisfaction/political alienation felt in parts of Western Canada. In a democratic society, sentiment always bears close scrutiny. Mood swings can and do influence political outcomes and the resulting policy stance pursued by governments of the day. These are extraordinary times. So yes, we’re paying very close attention to public opinion/sentiment, not just in the prairies but all across the country.

Notwithstanding the scent of potential political risk, there’s still a lot to like (and to be happy about) in the prairies against an uncertain geopolitical backdrop characterized by mounting energy and food insecurity. Particularly in Alberta and Saskatchewan, GDP growth has absolutely skyrocketed, making a relatively rich region even richer by national standards. Labour markets are firm. On balance, hiring intentions remain positive, which combined with a slew of existing job vacancies hints at solid wage prospects. True, commodity prices have come off their highs but in our base case view should nonetheless remain at a level supportive of marginal business investment.

We still like the economic risk profile in the prairies, characterized as it is by much greater leverage to natural resources/agriculture. Looked at another way, there’s been less reliance on housing and household debt, certainly versus the provinces that bookend the prairies (British Columbia and Ontario). Housing affordability hasn’t eroded nearly as badly, so it’s perhaps less-than-surprising that the unfolding correction in housing markets—brought about by aggressive policy rate tightening—has been much less dramatic. Expect that trend to continue.

Fiscal results continue to turn heads in the best way possible. Alberta’s recent Q1 update was one of the more astounding fiscal revisions we can recall, even if markets seemingly took the good news in stride. Resource leverage means fiscal volatility, but we continue to view all provincial debt as lower-beta relative to corporate credit. As it stands, there’s no shortage of budgetary leeway for select provincial governments to ease affordability pressures. Significant measures have been rolled out, and more are likely. It’s likewise safe to assume that PM Trudeau will take action at the national level. A related cabinet huddle has been scheduled ahead of an important fall legislative session.

In the same way that the feds have excess fiscal capacity, we count Alberta and Saskatchewan (along with Quebec) as provinces in a fiscally sustainable position longer term. While we’re on the subject of the long-term outlook, consider the population growth expected to arrive in the prairies over the coming decades. That’s fundamental fuel for economic growth, supporting the outlook for consumption/housing and by extension government revenue. It means these provinces—already relatively younger than the national average—will age at a slower rate than others. Long-term bond investors may wish to take note.

There’s more to it, as the string of images on the following pages tries to make clear. We won’t make the mistake of telling anyone how they should feel, but maybe there’s relatively less to be angry about in the prairies after all? Surely there are tougher places to be in what remains a topsy-turvy world. Call it a case of perception not necessarily fully reflecting reality. Make no mistake, resource-leveraged provinces would be at risk if the global economy enters a painful/serious recession. But even with rate hikes having come on faster than most thought possible (ourselves included), we still see scope to avert a deep and dark economic turn for the worse.

---

The prairie provinces pose for a socioeconomic-fiscal close-up

---

Chart 1: Pollara’s ‘Rage Index’ highest in Prairies (lowest in Que)
Pollara ‘Rage Index’: Share of respondents who feel annoyed/angry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Rage index</th>
<th>Personal finances</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cda</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BC</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alta</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Man/Sask</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ont</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Que</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atlantic</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NBF, Pollara Strategic Insights (survey conducted 25-Jul to 2-Aug)

Chart 2: Two-thirds of Albertans see economy in recession
Share of responses to “Do you believe Canada is currently in recession?” (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Don’t know</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cda</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BC</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alta</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Man/Sask</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ont</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Que</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atlantic</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NBF, Leger (survey conducted 5-Aug to 7-Aug)

*Rage* or least anger and annoyance appears to be greatest in the prairies. In some cases that might reflect a personal financial situation, even if these provinces have been making serious contributions to Canada’s economic recovery. Despite registering exceptional GDP growth, two-thirds of Albertans believe Canada is already in recession, a more dire and polarized outlook than elsewhere.
It would be tempting to blame the feds for much of the current level of dissatisfaction. Based on seat counts, relatively few in the prairies presumably see their interests championed by the ruling Liberal party. When it comes to national issues, healthcare remains a top concern. The provinces have their differences, but extra federal cash for healthcare is one thing they all agree is a pressing concern.

Interestingly, it seems those in the prairies are even more angry/annoyed with their provincial government. The provincial leadership is about to change in Alberta. Campaign rhetoric suggests the UCP race could have potential implications for federal-provincial relations. (Aside: Quebeckers appear much more satisfied with their government, pointing to a CAQ re-election in October.)
**Market View**

**Economics and Strategy**

**Chart 9: Inflation a noted obstacle for businesses**

Share of businesses citing ‘rising inflation’ as near-term obstacle: 2022:Q3

- Alberta: 69%
- Saskatchewan: 66%
- British Columbia: 63%
- Ontario: 61%
- Manitoba: 60%
- New Brunswick: 56%
- Nova Scotia: 54%
- Newfoundland & Labrador: 53%
- Quebec: 52%

*Source: NBF, StatCan | Note: See related comment on latest CSBC here*

**Chart 10: Yet small business confidence holding up**

CFIB Business Barometer: Aug-22 vs. Dec-21

*Source: NBF, CFIB | Note: Dotted line refers to Dec-21 reading*

**Chart 11: Nominal GDP explodes higher in Alta, Sask**

Nominal GDP growth: 2021 & 2022

*Source: NBF | Note: Nominal GDP forecasts will be updated in Sep-22 issue of MEM*

**Chart 12: The ‘rich’ getting richer? In a sense yes**

Nominal GDP per capita: 2021

*Source: NBF, StatCan*

**Chart 13: Employee compensation up, but has lagged**

Total employee compensation

*Source: NBF, StatCan*

**Chart 14: Labour markets remain firm**

Employment rate (i.e., share of working age population employed): Jul-22

*Source: NBF, StatCan*

---

As we explored in a separate note, businesses in Alberta and Saskatchewan are flagging ‘rising inflation’ as one of their most pressing worries. (Here again, Quebec appears to be at the other end of the spectrum.) Note, however, that the balance of opinion on hiring and demand remains positive in the prairies. And small business sentiment is relatively strong(er) vs. the larger provinces.

We don’t want to fall victim to backwards looking analysis, now that the peak for commodity prices may be behind us, but the nominal output generated in Canada’s resource-intensive jurisdictions has really been remarkable. It means nominal GDP per capita—a proxy for relative ‘richness’—which always remained above-average in Alberta and Saskatchewan has advanced mightily of late.

The pandemic certainly left a mark on labour markets in the prairies, and in some cases there was more slack to close up. But a legit employment recovery has been secured, with employment rates the strongest in the country (consistent with the pre-COVID trend). There are job vacancies everywhere in Canada, but one senses solid wage prospects in parts of Western Canada.
Market View

Economics and Strategy

Chart 15: Leverage to energy/primary industries has paid
Share of GDP: Energy sector vs. agriculture/other primary industries

Source: NBF, StatCan

Chart 16: A bumper crop for 2022 to boot
Total annual wheat production, including estimate for 2022

Source: NBF, StatCan

Chart 17: Less housing exposure/household debt than some
Household debt-to-income ratio: 2022:Q1

Source: NBF, StatCan

Chart 18: Housing correction so far less violent
Year-over-year growth in existing home sales: Jul-22

Source: NBF, CREA | Note: NBF’s Housing Affordability Monitor is available here

Chart 19: Massive fiscal turnaround as revenue floods in
Provincial budget balance-to-GDP ratio

Source: NBF, prov gov'ts | Note: Subject to change as public accounts/updates arrive

Chart 20: Notably lower net debt burdens in West
Net debt-to-GDP ratio: 2022-23

Source: NBF, fed-prov gov'ts

The economic model in evidence in the prairies, what with its leverage to energy and agriculture, is currently working well. Global energy and food insecurity pressures provide an opportunity for Canada to play a larger role internationally. Yes, there are energy infrastructure issues to sort of course; that’s not new. As for our farmers, they look to have a bumper crop on their hands in 2022. Meantime, we see less housing-related risk in the prairies than in some other parts of Canada. Household debt is perhaps a more pressing concern in Ontario and British Columbia, where real estate makes up a larger share of assets and housing has accounted for disproportionate growth. It suggests a less violent adjustment to higher mortgage rates in the prairies, which is already evident.

The fiscal side of things is no less important. Extraordinary revenue growth (e.g., 60% more revenue in Alberta in 2022-23 than what was once projected) has allowed for a swift budgetary recovery. In Saskatchewan and Alberta, deficits have been replaced by surpluses, with both jurisdictions pressing their net debt advantage. Excess fiscal room exists to address affordability pressures.
With lower debt burdens comes a less painful interest bite. So while borrowing costs have moved up, there’s little concern over debt affordability in Western Canada. Spreads have reacted to the improving fiscal fortunes, with Alberta once again sporting some of the lowest borrowing costs in the country. This province earned a recent upgrade, and along with Saskatchewan, is considered by the PBO to be one of the more fiscal sustainable jurisdictions in the country. (Here’s another shout out to Quebec, where responsible fiscal management has been on display for some time.)

Lest our commentary/analysis prove too short-term in nature for you, consider the longer-term demographic outlook for Canada’s prairie provinces. StatCan’s recent detailed population projections, which extend out more than twenty years for the provinces, are telling. There are more than a few scenarios to mull, but under most population growth looks to be relatively healthy. It means that the populations of Alberta, Saskatchewan and Manitoba are likely to remain relatively younger than other provinces. That’s a non-trivial consideration given provinces have primary constitutional responsibility for funding healthcare. Relatively stronger population growth, were it to materialize, would have any number of additional economic benefits, supporting potential growth and housing demand among other things.

If you want to get into the weeds on demographics—and we invite you to—there’s plenty of analysis that NBF Economics and Strategy can muster. As but one example, our colleagues Matthieu Arseneau and Alexandra Ducharme authored a recent Special Report on Canada’s population outlook. That report can be accessed here.
General

This Report was prepared by National Bank Financial, Inc. (NBF), (a Canadian investment dealer, member of IIROC), an indirect wholly owned subsidiary of National Bank of Canada. National Bank of Canada is a public company listed on the Toronto Stock Exchange.

The particulars contained herein were obtained from sources which we believe to be reliable but are not guaranteed by us and may be incomplete and may be subject to change without notice. The information is current as of the date of this document. Neither the author nor NBF assumes any obligation to update the information or advise on further developments relating to the topics or securities discussed. The opinions expressed are based upon the author(s) analysis and interpretation of these particulars and are not to be construed as a solicitation or offer to buy or sell the securities mentioned herein, and nothing in this Report constitutes a representation that any investment strategy or recommendation contained herein is suitable or appropriate to a recipient’s individual circumstances. In all cases, investors should conduct their own investigation and analysis of such information before taking or omitting to take any action in relation to securities or markets that are analyzed in this Report. The Report alone is not intended to form the basis for an investment decision, or to replace any due diligence or analytical work required by you in making an investment decision.

This Report is for distribution only under such circumstances as may be permitted by applicable law. This Report is not directed at you if NBF or any affiliate distributing this Report is prohibited or restricted by any legislation or regulation in any jurisdiction from making it available to you. You should satisfy yourself before reading it that NBF is permitted to provide this Report to you under relevant legislation and regulations.

National Bank of Canada Financial Markets is a trade name used by National Bank Financial and National Bank of Canada Financial Inc.

Canadian Residents

NBF or its affiliates may engage in any trading strategies described herein for their own account or on a discretionary basis on behalf of certain clients and as market conditions change, may amend or change investment strategy including full and complete divestment. The trading interests of NBF and its affiliates may also be contrary to any opinions expressed in this Report.

NBF or its affiliates often act as financial advisor, agent or underwriter for certain issuers mentioned herein and may receive remuneration for its services. As well NBF and its affiliates and/or their officers, directors, representatives, associates, may have a position in the securities mentioned herein and may make purchases and/or sales of these securities from time to time in the open market or otherwise. NBF and its affiliates may make a market in securities mentioned in this Report. This Report may not be independent of the proprietary interests of NBF and its affiliates.

This Report is not considered a research product under Canadian law and regulation, and consequently is not governed by Canadian rules applicable to the publication and distribution of research Reports, including relevant restrictions or disclosures required to be included in research Reports.
UK Residents

This Report is a marketing document. This Report has not been prepared in accordance with EU legal requirements designed to promote the independence of investment research and it is not subject to any prohibition on dealing ahead of the dissemination of investment research. In respect of the distribution of this Report to UK residents, NBF has approved the contents (including, where necessary, for the purposes of Section 21(1) of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000). This Report is for information purposes only and does not constitute a personal recommendation, or investment, legal or tax advice. NBF and/or its parent and/or any companies within or affiliates of the National Bank of Canada group and/or any of their directors, officers and employees may have or may have had interests or long or short positions in, and may at any time make purchases and/or sales as principal or agent, or may act or may have acted as market maker in the relevant investments or related investments discussed in this Report, or may act or have acted as investment and/or commercial banker with respect hereto. The value of investments, and the income derived from them, can go down as well as up and you may not get back the amount invested. Past performance is not a guide to future performance. If an investment is denominated in a foreign currency, rates of exchange may have an adverse effect on the value of the investment. Investments which are illiquid may be difficult to sell or realise; it may also be difficult to obtain reliable information about their value or the extent of the risks to which they are exposed. Certain transactions, including those involving futures, swaps, and other derivatives, give rise to substantial risk and are not suitable for all investors. The investments contained in this Report are not available to retail customers and this Report is not for distribution to retail clients (within the meaning of the rules of the Financial Conduct Authority). Persons who are retail clients should not act or rely upon the information in this Report. This Report does not constitute or form part of any offer for sale or subscription of or solicitation of any offer to buy or subscribe for the securities described herein nor shall it or any part of it form the basis of or be relied on in connection with any contract or commitment whatsoever.

This information is only for distribution to Eligible Counterparties and Professional Clients in the United Kingdom within the meaning of the rules of the Financial Conduct Authority. NBF is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and has its registered office at 70 St. Mary Axe, London, EC3A 8BE. NBF is not authorised by the Prudential Regulation Authority and the Financial Conduct Authority to accept deposits in the United Kingdom.

U.S. Residents

With respect to the distribution of this report in the United States of America, National Bank of Canada Financial Inc. ("NBCFI") which is regulated by the Financial Industry Regulatory Authority (FINRA) and a member of the Securities Investor Protection Corporation (SIPC), an affiliate of NBF, accepts responsibility for its contents, subject to any terms set out above. To make further inquiry related to this report, or to effect any transaction, United States residents should contact their NBCFI registered representative.

This report is not a research report and is intended for Major U.S. Institutional Investors only.

This report is not subject to U.S. independence and disclosure standards applicable to research reports.

HK Residents

With respect to the distribution of this report in Hong Kong by NBC Financial Markets Asia Limited ("NBCFMA")which is licensed by the Securities and Futures Commission ("SFC") to conduct Type 1 (dealing in securities) and Type 3 (leveraged foreign exchange trading) regulated activities, the contents of this report are solely for informational purposes. It has not been approved by, reviewed by, verified by or filed with any regulator in Hong Kong. Nothing herein is a recommendation, advice, offer or solicitation to buy or sell a product or service, nor an official confirmation of any transaction. None of the products issuers, NBCFMA or its affiliates or other persons or entities named herein are obliged to notify you of changes to any information and none of the foregoing assume any loss suffered by you in reliance of such information.

The content of this report may contain information about investment products which are not authorized by SFC for offering to the public in Hong Kong and such information will only be available to, those persons who are Professional Investors (as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance of Hong Kong ("SFO"). If you are in any doubt as to your status you should consult a financial adviser or contact us. This material is not meant to be marketing materials and is not intended for public distribution. Please note that neither this material nor the product referred to is authorized for sale by SFC. Please refer to product prospectus for full details.

There may be conflicts of interest relating to NBCFMA or its affiliates’ businesses. These activities and interests include potential multiple advisory, transactional and financial and other interests in securities and instruments that may be purchased or sold by NBCFMA or its affiliates, or in other investment vehicles which are managed by NBCFMA or its affiliates that may purchase or sell such securities and instruments.

No other entity within the National Bank of Canada group, including National Bank of Canada and National Bank Financial Inc, is licensed or registered with the SFC. Accordingly, such entities and their employees are not permitted and do not intend to: (i) carry on a business in any regulated activity in Hong Kong; (ii) hold themselves out as carrying on a business in any regulated activity in Hong Kong; or (iii) actively market their services to the Hong Kong public.

Copyright

This Report may not be reproduced in whole or in part, or further distributed or published or referred to in any manner whatsoever, nor may the information, opinions or conclusions contained in it be referred to without in each case the prior express written consent of NBF.