Inflation frustration: What is wrong with CPI-common?

By Taylor Schleich, Alexandra Ducharme & Matthieu Arseneau

Like us, you may have noticed a significant revision to one of the BoC’s preferred core inflation measures in Wednesday’s CPI report. Indeed, CPI-common, the measure the BoC has tended to favour, saw its May print revised from 3.9% to 4.5%. But there weren’t just revisions to May, with significant changes over the last 15 months. While a single month’s revision won’t make much of a difference in the big picture, the cumulative effect over a year-and-a-half of one-way adjustments means the path for core inflation we now see is much different than we’d initially been told. Had we been armed with June 2022’s estimates at the time of each month’s release, we would’ve seen CPI-common rise above 2% in April 2021. That would’ve been closer in line with the trajectory of the Bank’s other core measures—CPI-Trim and CPI-Median. Instead, the more tepid initial publication suggested CPI-Common didn’t cross the 2% mark until December 2021. As Tiff Macklem highlighted after the BoC’s 25 bp March rate hike, “CPI-common … was only 2.3% in January”. We’re now told it was 3.2%.

Canada: There’s nothing “common” about these inflation revisions

Latest data suggests common-core inflation rose above 2% eight months earlier than first estimated

Because the CPI-common is model-based and revaluated over the full time series each month, small monthly revisions to the entire sample are nothing new. In 2013, a BoC working paper argued that “in the absence of significant changes to the time-series properties of inflation, we do not believe that potential future revisions to the common component of CPI are a cause for concern”. It is true that revisions to the CPI-common were very limited in the past years. But frankly, the recent revisions are a cause for concern. So, what’s going on here? Has there been a change in the “time-series properties of inflation”? Yes, we think you have noticed that we are experiencing a period of very high inflation compared to the last three decades. This shift has challenged the statistical method the CPI-common is based on. Sorry, but we’ll need to get more technical here—we promise it will be worth it (for more details on the methodology of BoC core measures see [link]). The input data for CPI-common are the 55 CPI components adjusted to remove the effect of changes in indirect taxes. A first point to be aware of is that components in the CPI are never revised historically and no seasonal adjustment process is made on input data used to compute CPI-common (as opposed to CPI-Trim and CPI-Med). Historical revisions of input data can therefore be excluded from the cause of revisions. So, what’s the next step? The 55 historical series are normalized over the entire sample. From these, a factor model is performed to pull out the first principal component that best explains the common source underlying the annual changes in the 55 series. As the below chart shows, revisions to the first principal component can be blamed for at least part of the recent revisions to CPI-common. While the result of the factor model was essentially unchanged as observations were added from March to December 2021, when annual inflation was still below 5%, the recent acceleration of inflation resulted in notable revisions to the output of the factor model for 2021 and 2022. We have pinned the first part of the problem.

The 2022 price surge has led to significant revisions to the FPC…

First principal component (FPC) of price variation of the 55 CPI components from March 2021 to June 2022

But the revisions were not limited to the recent period. We noted that data has been significantly revised for the full sample.

Revisions to CPI-common going all the way back to the 1990s

CPI-common; March 2021 vs June 2022 releases

2021Q4 2022Q1 2022Q2 2022Q3 2022Q4

2021Q1 2021Q2 2021Q3 2021Q4
Still, looking at the full sample, we denote only slight historical revisions for the principal component using data until March 2021 compared to when we add the recent episode. The historical revisions to the CPI–common we recently witnessed can thus not be fully attributed to changes in the factor model. We need to continue our investigation.

... but we need to look elsewhere to explain historical revisions
First principal component of price variation of the 55 CPI components in March 2021 and June 2022

The final step to computing CPI–common is to scale the first principal to the inflation rate with the aim to have an indicator consistent with other inflation measures. This value is obtained through a simple linear regression of the annual inflation rates of the all-items CPI excluding the effect of changes in indirect taxes against an intercept and the first principal component previously described. This is where the second part of the problem lies. It is a well-known property of linear regressions that their coefficients are highly sensitive to outliers in the data. And in terms of outliers to inflation, this past year receives the gold medal. Prices have surged, which reinforced the relation between the dependent and independent variables (leading to a higher beta after being stable over the past six years).

The regression coefficient has reacted to the surge in inflation
Rolling beta of CPI excl. taxes (y/y %) = C + beta*(first principal component)

The beta having increased month after month means higher sensitivity to a change in the principal component over the entire sample. To illustrate this, we used the beta and the constant generated from the CPI–common regression calculated in March 2021 (before headline inflation crossed the BoC’s upper range of target) and in June 2022. As per the next chart, the two simulations of resulting common inflation show significant divergence over the full sample. Had the beta and constant remained unchanged since March, CPI common would have stood at 3.7% in June 2022 instead of the 4.6% reported. Of course, this is only a means of demonstrating that the statistical method used to compute the common CPI is highly reactive to outliers in the data. We are not suggesting that the reported CPI–common was too high in June, but rather it shows how adding a minimal number of observations can change drastically the picture portrayed by this indicator.

CPI–common estimations have been sensitive to new data
CPI–common estimated until June 2022 using regressions generated in March 2021 and in June 2022

Conclusion
In the recent volatile inflationary episode, the CPI–common has not played its role of identifying the surge in underlying inflation in Canada. Given this, we’re concerned that monetary policy has been set, at least partially, on a measure that has since proven unreliable and/or inaccurate. We don’t want to say that today’s inflation could’ve been fully avoided had the BoC leaned more on its
other core measures and tightened policy earlier. But tightening policy earlier—when the BoC’s other two preferred core measures were flagging stronger underlying price pressures—could’ve helped arrest some domestic demand-driven inflationary pressures (and limit the run-up in house prices that continued into 2022). An earlier start to the tightening cycle might have also meant that the Bank could’ve been more gradual in its rate hikes rather than the frantic (or “front-loaded”) pace of tightening we’re now embarking on.

In 2019, the BoC assessed the relevance of each of the core inflation components based on a list of criteria. The common CPI emerged as the winner of this assessment, receiving the top performing distinction in terms of high persistence and low volatility. But over the past year, its strengths may have become its weaknesses.

### Summary of evaluation of trend-inflation measures

However, they had recognized that the methodology is not easily understood (really???). For this reason, over the past year, it has been extremely difficult for observers to raise doubts about the diverging messages sent by CPI-common compared to other core inflation measures. This past year, among all inflation measures considered by the BoC, the CPI-common has been the only one not raising flags, and even after revisions still shows the lowest annual inflation. Our confidence towards this indicator is shaken by the fact that CPI-common exhibits the weakest correlation with other core measures. Given the obvious weaknesses (and unreliability) of CPI-common, we recommend the Bank does not reiterate its confidence in this indicator going forward. Instead, we suggest focusing on CPI-Trim and CPI-median.

In our opinion, these have proven better at capturing underlying inflation trends and importantly, they are easy-to-understand and are more consistent with core measures published by other central banks (i.e., the St. Louis Fed’s 16% Trimmed-Mean and the Cleveland Fed’s median CPI).
Economics and Strategy

Montreal Office
514-879-2529
Stéfane Marion
Chief Economist and Strategist
stefane.marion@nbc.ca
Kyle Dahms
Economist
kyle.dahms@nbc.ca
Alexandra Ducharme
Economist
alexandra.ducharme@nbc.ca

Matthieu Arseneau
Deputy Chief Economist
matthieu.arseneau@nbc.ca
Daren King
Economist
daren.king@nbc.ca
Angelo Katsoras
Geopolitical Analyst
angelo.katsoras@nbc.ca

Jocelyn Paquet
Economist
jocelyn.paquet@nbc.ca

Toronto Office
416-869-8598
Warren Lovely
Chief Rates and Public Sector Strategist
warren.lovely@nbc.ca
Taylor Schleich
Rates Strategist
taylor.schleich@nbc.ca

General
This Report was prepared by National Bank Financial, Inc. (NBF), (a Canadian investment dealer, member of IIROC), an indirect wholly owned subsidiary of National Bank of Canada. National Bank of Canada is a public company listed on the Toronto Stock Exchange.

The particulars contained herein were obtained from sources which we believe to be reliable but are not guaranteed by us and may be incomplete and may be subject to change without notice. The information is current as of the date of this document. Neither the author nor NBF assumes any obligation to update the information or advise on further developments relating to the topics or securities discussed. The opinions expressed are based upon the author(s) analysis and interpretation of these particulars and are not to be construed as a solicitation or offer to buy or sell the securities mentioned herein, and nothing in this Report constitutes a representation that any investment strategy or recommendation contained herein is suitable or appropriate to a recipient’s individual circumstances. In all cases, investors should conduct their own investigation and analysis of such information before taking or omitting to take any action in relation to securities or markets that are analyzed in this Report. The Report alone is not intended to form the basis for an investment decision, or to replace any due diligence or analytical work required by you in making an investment decision.

This Report is for distribution only under such circumstances as may be permitted by applicable law. This Report is not directed at you if NBF or any affiliate distributing this Report is prohibited or restricted by any legislation or regulation in any jurisdiction from making it available to you. You should satisfy yourself before reading it that NBF is permitted to provide this Report to you under relevant legislation and regulations.

National Bank of Canada Financial Markets is a trade name used by National Bank Financial and National Bank of Canada Financial Inc.

Canadian Residents
NBF or its affiliates may engage in any trading strategies described herein for their own account or on a discretionary basis on behalf of certain clients and as market conditions change, may amend or change investment strategy including full and complete divestment. The trading interests of NBF and its affiliates may also be contrary to any opinions expressed in this Report.

NBF or its affiliates often act as financial advisor, agent or underwriter for certain issuers mentioned herein and may receive remuneration for its services. As well NBF and its affiliates and/or their officers, directors, representatives, associates, may have a position in the securities mentioned herein and may make purchases and/or sales of these securities from time to time in the open market or otherwise. NBF and its affiliates may make a market in securities mentioned in this Report. This Report may not be independent of the proprietary interests of NBF and its affiliates.

This Report is not considered a research product under Canadian law and regulation, and consequently is not governed by Canadian rules applicable to the publication and distribution of research Reports, including relevant restrictions or disclosures required to be included in research Reports.
UK Residents

This Report is a marketing document. This Report has not been prepared in accordance with EU legal requirements designed to promote the independence of investment research and it is not subject to any prohibition on dealing ahead of the dissemination of investment research. In respect of the distribution of this Report to UK residents, NBF has approved the contents (including, where necessary, for the purposes of Section 21(1) of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000). This Report is for information purposes only and does not constitute a personal recommendation, or investment, legal or tax advice. NBF and/or its parent and/or any companies within or affiliates of the National Bank of Canada group and/or any of their directors, officers and employees may have or may have had interests in long or short positions in, and may at any time make purchases and/or sales as principal or agent, or may act or may have acted as market maker in the relevant investments or related investments discussed in this Report, or may act or have acted as investment and/or commercial banker with respect hereto. The value of investments, and the income derived from them, can go down as well as up and you may not get back the amount invested. Past performance is not a guide to future performance. If an investment is denominated in a foreign currency, rates of exchange may have an adverse effect on the value of the investment. Investments which are illiquid may be difficult to sell or realise; it may also be difficult to obtain reliable information about their value or the extent of the risks to which they are exposed. Certain transactions, including those involving futures, swaps, and other derivatives, give rise to substantial risk and are not suitable for all investors. The investments contained in this Report are not available to retail customers and this Report is not for distribution to retail clients (within the meaning of the rules of the Financial Conduct Authority). Persons who are retail clients should not act or rely upon the information in this Report. This Report does not constitute or form part of any offer for sale or subscription of or solicitation of any offer to buy or subscribe for the securities described herein nor shall it or any part of it form the basis of or be relied on in connection with any contract or commitment whatsoever.

This information is only for distribution to Eligible Counterparties and Professional Clients in the United Kingdom within the meaning of the rules of the Financial Conduct Authority. NBF is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and has its registered office at 70 St. Mary Axe, London, EC3A 8BE. NBF is not authorised by the Prudential Regulation Authority and the Financial Conduct Authority to accept deposits in the United Kingdom.

U.S. Residents

With respect to the distribution of this report in the United States of America, National Bank of Canada Financial Inc. ("NBCFI") which is regulated by the Financial Industry Regulatory Authority (FINRA) and a member of the Securities Investor Protection Corporation (SIPC), an affiliate of NBF, accepts responsibility for its contents, subject to any terms set out above. To make further inquiry related to this report, or to effect any transaction, United States residents should contact their NBCFI registered representative.

This report is not a research report and is intended for Major U.S. Institutional Investors only.

This report is not subject to U.S. independence and disclosure standards applicable to research reports.

HK Residents

With respect to the distribution of this report in Hong Kong by NBC Financial Markets Asia Limited ("NBCFMA") which is licensed by the Securities and Futures Commission ("SFC") to conduct Type 1 (dealing in securities) and Type 3 (leveraged foreign exchange trading) regulated activities, the contents of this report are solely for informational purposes. It has not been approved by, reviewed by, verified by or filed with any regulator in Hong Kong. Nothing herein is a recommendation, advice, offer or solicitation to buy or sell a product or service, nor an official confirmation of any transaction. None of the products issuers, NBCFMA or its affiliates or other persons or entities named herein are obliged to notify you of changes to any information and none of the foregoing assume any loss suffered by you in reliance of such information.

The content of this report may contain information about investment products which are not authorized by SFC for offering to the public in Hong Kong and such information will only be available to, those persons who are Professional Investors (as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance of Hong Kong ("SFO")). If you are in any doubt as to your status you should consult a financial adviser or contact us. This material is not meant to be marketing materials and is not intended for public distribution. Please note that neither this material nor the product referred to is authorized for sale by SFC. Please refer to product prospectus for full details.

There may be conflicts of interest relating to NBCFMA or its affiliates’ businesses. These activities and interests include potential multiple advisory, transactional and financial and other interests in securities and instruments that may be purchased or sold by NBCFMA or its affiliates, or in other investment vehicles which are managed by NBCFMA or its affiliates that may purchase or sell such securities and instruments.

No other entity within the National Bank of Canada group, including National Bank of Canada and National Bank Financial Inc., is licensed or registered with the SFC. Accordingly, such entities and their employees are not permitted and do not intend to: (i) carry on a business in any regulated activity in Hong Kong; (ii) hold themselves out as carrying on a business in any regulated activity in Hong Kong; or (iii) actively market their services to the Hong Kong public.

Copyright

This Report may not be reproduced in whole or in part, or further distributed or published or referred to in any manner whatsoever, nor may the information, opinions or conclusions contained in it be referred to without in each case the prior express written consent of NBF.